# The Burden & Dynamic of Post-COVID Conditions: A Patient-Centric Perspective

Nathaniel Osgood

Includes Joint Work with Drs. Donna Goodridge, Gary Groot, Segun Oyedokun & Jenny Basran

### Mythbusting: Common PCC/Long COVID Misconceptions

- Is psychosomatic in origin
- Is limited to those who experienced serious acute COVID-19 symptoms
- Is a single, monolithic condition
- Exhibits a unstructured, scattershot collection of symptoms
- Consists of symptoms that originate in acute phase and resolve over time
- Imposes burden limited to bearing with such symptoms
- Is a squishy set of nuisance symptoms medicalized by the privileged
- Is adequately captured in administrative databases and electronic health records

**Pandemics** disable people – the history lesson that policy makers **IGNORE** (Spinney, 2022. Nature)

- 1918 Spanish influenza outbreak considered the "mother of all pandemics" – 80% of all people who developed encephalitis lethargica went on to develop Parkinson-like symptoms
- •1955 20-85% of polio survivors relapsed
- 1957 and 1968 influenza pandemics followed by rises in encephalitis
- •2014 Post-Ebola syndrome recognized

Social costs are enormous when policymakers ignore the tail risk of pandemics

Source: Donna Goodridge

## Long COVID could become a significant chronic disease

Both Hospitalized AND non-hospitalized impacted

Long COVID could become Finland's largest chronic disease, warns minister

#### A Tsunami of Disability Is Coming as a Result of 'Long COVID'

We need to plan for a future where millions of survivors are chronically ill

#### Fig. 1: COVID-19-related neurological deficits.

### The NEW ENGLAND JOURNAL of MEDICINE

2021. Factoring in new infections in unvaccinated people, we can conservatively expect more than 15 million cases of long Covid resulting from this pandemic. And though data are still emerging, the average age of patients with long Covid is about 40. which means that the majority are in their prime working years. Given these demographics, long Covid is likely to cast a long shadow on our health care system and economic recovery.



Perspective AUGUST 12, 202

#### Confronting Our Next National Health Disaster - Long-Haul Covid

Steven Phillips, M.D., M.P.H., and Michelle A. Williams, Sc.D.

https://www.thelancet.com/journals/eclinm/article/PIIS2589-5370(21)00324-2/fulltext

https://www.nature.com/articles/d41586-021-01693-6

https://www.reuters.com/article/us-health-coronavirus-finland-long-covid-idUSKBN2JH14W

#### Isquo-long-covid-rsquo/

#### RESEARCH PAPER | VOLUME 39, 101044, SEPTEMBER 01, 2021

Cognitive deficits in people who have recovered from COVID-19

Adam Hampshire 🙁 🖂 🛛 William Trender + Samuel R Chamberlain + Amy E. Jolly + Jon E. Grant + Fiona Patrick et al. Show all authors

pen Access + Published: July 22, 2021 + DOI: https://doi.org/10.1016/i.eclinm.2021.101044



Mechanisms indicated by asterisks were proposed on the basis of data that emerged from hospitals in Wuhan, China in the first two months of 2020 (ref.<sup>3</sup>). SARS-CoV-2 produces viral loads in the oral cavity and nose (1) that cause infection of the olfactory mucosa and olfactory bulb<sup>4</sup> to reach the brain (2-4). Viral budding from neuronal cells in the frontal lobe has been documented<sup>7</sup>. Vascular mechanisms that can cause neuronal damage are shown (3). Brain involvement (4) is thought to elicit specific clinical features (5) that are indicative of CNS injury. ACE2, angiotensin-converting enzyme 2 receptor: NRP1, neuropilin-1, Adapted with permission from ref.<sup>3</sup>

#### https://www.nature.com/articles/s41582-021-00593-7?s=09

https://academic.oup.com/eurhearti/advancearticle/doi/10.1093/eurhearti/ehab914/6499078

https://www.scientificamerican.com/article/a-tsunami-of-disability-is-coming-as-a-result-of-

Some Images adapted from partner Dr. J. Basran (SHA)

## Update on Long COVID

(Hammond et al., SK COVID Evidence Support Team, March 2022)

- •Common Case Definition: COVID-related symptoms that persist or emerge beyond 4 weeks of infection with 2 phases:
  - Ongoing symptomatic COVID-19 (OSC) signs and symptoms from 4-12 weeks from initial infection
  - Post-COVID-19 syndrome (PSC) signs and symptoms beyond 12 weeks with respect to symptomatology, abnormal functioning, psychological burden and quality of life

 $\circ$  Long COVID includes both OCS and PCS

Slide adapted from Donna Goodridge

## COVID-19: Longer-term symptoms among Canadian adults - First report

Last updated: 2023-03-24 🛛 🛃 PDF

The first report, Frequency and impact of longer-term symptoms following COVID-19 in Canadian adults, was published in the Fall of 2022

HighlightsSecond report: Spring 2023First report: Fall 2022

#### On this page

- <u>Context</u>
- How common are longer-term COVID-19 symptoms and who is more likely to experience them?
- What symptoms are most commonly reported by adults with longer-term COVID-19 symptoms?
- How long do symptoms last in adults with longer-term COVID-19 symptoms?
- How do longer-term COVID-19 symptoms affect daily activities, paid work, and schooling?
- Future work
- <u>Technical notes</u>
- Additional resources
- <u>Acknowledgment</u>

#### Context

Coronavirus Disease 2019 (COVID-19), caused by an infection with severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus 2 (SARS-CoV-2), has had a substantial impact in Canada. As of September 3, 2022, about 4.2 million infections, confirmed by polymerase chain reaction (PCR), had been officially <u>reported to the Public Health Agency of Canada</u> by the provinces and territories. The severity of an acute SARS-CoV-2 infection can vary from being completely asymptomatic to severe

Associations between Longer-term Symptoms after COVID-19 and Sociodemographics, Health Characteristics, Period of Infection, and Vaccination Status in Canadian Adults, January 2020 to August 2022



#### Context

Coronavirus Disease 2019 (COVID-19), caused by an infection with severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus 2 (SARS-CoV-2), has had a substantial impact in Canada. COVID-19 was the third leading cause of death in Canada in 2020 after cancer and heart disease, and significantly increased the demand for intensive care unit resources: from March 2020 to June 2021, there were almost 14,000 additional respiratory admissions in intensive care units compared with the pre-pandemic period (excluding Quebec). The indirect effects of the COVID-19 pandemic on other health conditions were also considerable with almost 560,000 fewer surgeries from March 2020 to June 2021 compared with the pre-pandemic period (excluding Quebec).

As of December 23, 2022, about 4.5 million infections, confirmed by polymerase chain reaction (PCR), had been officially reported to the Public Health Agency of Canada by the provinces and territories. This number, however, understates the true number of infected Canadians as it excludes those who test positive using rapid antigen tests (RAT) only, and those who did not get tested or may "long COVID" when not resolved within three months of infection. Some of the more commonly reported symptoms include fatigue, coughing, shortness of breath, brain fog, and general weakness. With such a large number of infected Canadians, the potential burden of longer-term symptoms on individuals and their families, the healthcare system, and the economy through lost productivity, could be substantial.

Research published to date indicates that females and people who experience a more severe initial SARS-CoV-2 infection are at higher risk of developing longer-term symptoms. The virulence of the SARS-CoV-2 variant may also affect the risk of developing longer-term symptoms with Omicron variant infections being associated with a lower risk than earlier variants. With respect to protective factors, emerging evidence suggests that vaccination with two or more doses of COVID-19 vaccine prior to infection may reduce the risk of developing longer-term symptoms. Much, however, remains unknown regarding vulnerable populations, and risk and protective factors.

To address these and other information gaps, the Public Health Agency of Canada partnered with Statistics

### Existing Long COVID in SK Study Ecosystem

- Entry point: Longitudinal smartphone based collection (rolling enrollment commenced February 2022); substantive respondents ~ 650
- Qualitative arm: Focus groups
- Long COVID mental health self-compassion app & data collection
- Dyspnea (pulmonary function tests, etc., exercise tolerance, etc.)
- Immunology

## Survey

Questions include:	Whether or not you have had COVID	Vaccination status
Presence of 20 important symptoms known to be common with Long COVID	If a symptom is present, additional questions about that symptom, severity therapies used and satisfaction with care	Questions on the presence of Post-Exertional Malaise and its impact on you

Adapted from source: Donna Goodridge

### Ethico https://ethicadata.com

- Platform offering smartphone & web interfaces for participants, web administrative interfaces
- Interface, questionnaire types&content, triggering conditions & configuration modifiable in real-time
- Context-triggered questionnaires & EMAs
- Adaptive message delivery
- Monitoring sensors (steps, screen time, GPS, accel...)
- Interfaces for broad class of wearables
- Participant reachout in de-identified fashion
- Vast majority of studies require no programming
- Gamification interface (badges & point accrual)
- HIPAA & GDPR compliant
- CEPHIL origin, used in 100s of studies worldwide

	Lyme Disease San	nple Study	
	Actions About	Streams	
I saw/heard a Lyme Dis	ease advisory for my area	3	>
I removed a new tick			>
I have a rash			;

## Long COVID Study Interface Elements

							Sec. 1			
7:39 🖬 🖻 🗖 🛱 •	`` @ ⊝ ♥⊿ 🕯			7:38 🖬 🗭 🗖 🗭 🔹	() () () () () () () () () () () () () (		25.02200			
×	SKIP	Ethica	@	×		This survey should be co experience a NEW symp	mpleted if you tom that has not			
You are invited to participate in a research study		Your study setup is incomplete.	CONTINUE	Have you had COVID-19? This confirmed COVID-19, or if you	can be medically I think you have	REPORTED symptom has come back o changed. Please select any new symp				
not you have had COVID-19 in Saska not you have had COVID-19. T 50 questions in this survey. Th	atcnewan, whether or There is a maximum of he survey will take you	My Activities		contracted COVID-19 without confirmation.	a diagnosis or	previously reported sym come back.	ptoms that have			
between 10 and 20 minutes. Note: If you have gotten a vac you will need to have the date vaccinated available for one o	tcine for COVID-19 e of when you were of the survey question	Follow-		• Yes		Laura				
responses.	,	Up Survey		○ Not Sure		Shortness of breat	k:			
Once you answer this first sur will be promoted by the App o	rvey, a follow up survey once a month. Also, at	Optional Activities		° No		Cough				
participate in focus discussion be kept completely confidenti	n groups. Your data will ial and no personally					🗆 Joint pain				
	e iniked to your data.					Chest pain				
consent form information on this st consent form information. Ple <u>SKlongCOVID@USASK.ca</u> if yo App or have additional questi	ady is in the ease contact u have trouble with the ons on the study.	Report Symptom	Help/FAQ			Heart palpitations				
Consent to Participate: By con this questionnaire, <b>your free a</b> implied and indicates that you	npleting and submitting and informed consent is					<ul> <li>Myocarditis (inflam heart muscle)</li> </ul>	mation of the			
conditions of participation in t	this study.					Depression				
						🗆 Headache				
						ं Fever				
(      PREVIOUS	♦ NEXT	^	_	Trevious	↓ NEXT					

×

SKIP

### Web-Based Administrative Dashboard

Participati Here you ca	ion (647) an view the list of participants in your study	y, and the summary of their adher	ence to the study requirements.			INVITE PARTICIPANTS
<b>0</b> #	Enrollment Type: Public Study Registration Code: 1913		Ø 1	Registration URL: 🔋 🕼 🕻	OPY LINK	EDIT
						🛓 Download as CSV
	Ethica ID 🔺	Label 🛦	Last Recorded Data 🔺	Joined In 🔺	In Operation 🔺	Session Stats 🔺
D	42176	Researcher	2022-06-05 08:00	2022-02-03 22:50		
D	48258	Researcher	2022-02-04 11:28	2022-02-04 11:06		
	48532		2022-05-18 15:14	2022-02-08 12:21		
	10801		2022-02-08 08:07	2022-02-08 07:46		_
D	48533		2022-02-08 12:38	2022-02-08 12:26		
	48523		2022-03-10 13:14	2022-02-08 10:27		
	48524		2022-03-10 10:35	2022-02-08 10:31		
D	48536		2022-05-10 03:37	2022-02-08 12:54		
	48543		2022-02-08 14:23	2022-02-08 14:14		
	48545		2022-04-10 08:00	2022-02-08 14:22		
D	48550		2022-02-08 15:16	2022-02-08 14:57		
	48553		2022-02-08 15:03	2022-02-08 15:03		
	48556		2022-02-08 15:15	2022-02-08 15:04		

### Long COVID Focus Groups: Methods

Interpretive descriptive study using thematic analysis Volunteer sample from consenting participants in Long COVID survey project

## Long COVID Focus Group Findings

- •41 individuals from 8 Canadian provinces took part in 10 90 minutes focus groups conducted in Feb/Mar 2022
- •Mean age 47.9 yrs, SD (10.4)
- •28 (68.3%) female
- •Mean time elapsed since acute COVID infection 15.8 months, SD (6.4)
- •73.2% reported no pre-existing chronic illness
- •29 (70.7%) had not been hospitalized during acute infection
- •17 (41.4%) had to change employment as a result of persistent symptoms

### Canada: Age-Specific Prevalence of Long Term Symptoms among those with Confirmed or Suspected Infection

Overall prevalence: 14.8% of infections -- about 1.4 million Canadians (4.6% of Canadian adults)



Source: Canadian COVID-19 Antibody and Health Survey-Cycle 2.

Note: Longer-term symptoms are defined as self-reported persistent, recurring, or new symptoms 3 or more months after a positive COVID-19 test or suspected infection. Education refers to the highest certificate, diploma, or degree completed by anyone in the household. Estimates exclude the territories. COVID-19 = Coronavirus Disease 2019.

Source: PHAC, StatsCan & CITF, Associations between Longer-term Symptoms after COVID-19 and Sociodemographics, Health Characteristics, Period of Infection, and Vaccination Status in Canadian Adults, January 2020 to August 2022 (March 2023) <a href="https://health-infobase.canada.ca/src/doc/post-covid-condition/Association-Between-Longer-term-Symptoms-after-COVID-19.pdf">https://health-infobase.canada.ca/src/doc/post-covid-condition/Association-Between-Longer-term-Symptoms-after-COVID-19.pdf</a>

### PCC Burden: Marked Birth Sex, SES & Sexual Orientation Disparities

Figure 2: Percent of Adults (Aged 18+) Self-reporting Longer-term Symptoms after a Positive COVID-19 Test or Suspected Infection by Sociodemographics, Canada, January 2020 to August 2022



Note: Longer-term symptoms are defined as self-reported persistent, recurring, or new symptoms 3 or more months after a positive COVID-19 test or suspected infection. Education refers to the highest certificate, diploma, or degree completed by anyone in the household. Estimates exclude the territories. COVID-19 = Coronavirus Disease 2019.

Source: PHAC, StatsCan & CITF, Associations between Longer-term Symptoms after COVID-19 and Sociodemographics, Health Characteristics, Period of Infection, and Vaccination Status in Canadian Adults, January 2020 to August 2022 (March 2023) <a href="https://health-infobase.canada.ca/src/doc/post-covid-condition/Association-Between-Longer-term-Symptoms-after-COVID-19.pdf">https://health-infobase.canada.ca/src/doc/post-covid-condition/Association-Between-Longer-term-Symptoms-after-COVID-19.pdf</a>

## **Reported Symptom Severity bySex**

Symptom Severity Reported by Participants Shortness of Breath -Cough -Joint -Chest Pain -Heart Palpitations -Depression -Headaches -Average Symptom Severity Fever -Rash -Symptoms 8 Hair Loss -Smell -7 Sleep Problems -6 Memory Problems -5 Brain Fog -Anxiety -4 Mood Changes -Fatigue -Dead Heavy Feeling -Sore -Mental Fatigue -MinEx -Drained -Female Male

Sex

### PCC by Weight & Disability Status



Source: Canadian COVID-19 Antibody and Health Survey-Cycle 2.

Note: Longer-term symptoms are defined as self-reported persistent, recurring, or new symptoms 3 or more months after a positive COVID-19 test or suspected infection. Estimates exclude the territories. BMI = body mass index, COVID-19 = Coronavirus Disease 2019.

Source: PHAC, StatsCan & CITF, Associations between Longer-term Symptoms after COVID-19 and Sociodemographics, Health Characteristics, Period of Infection, and Vaccination Status in Canadian Adults, January 2020 to August 2022 (March 2023) <a href="https://health-infobase.canada.ca/src/doc/post-covid-condition/Association-Between-Longer-term-Symptoms-after-COVID-19.pdf">https://health-infobase.canada.ca/src/doc/post-covid-condition/Association-Between-Longer-term-Symptoms-after-COVID-19.pdf</a>

### Long COVID & Health Disparities

- While data with sufficient confirmatory resolution remains elusive, the burden of Long COVID fall **strongly disproportionately** on
- Women
  - Higher risk of inflammatory Long COVID endotype/Post-COVID fatigue syndrome
- Low SES populations
  - Higher risk of infection (crowded housing, essential jobs, etc.)
  - Lower vaccination rates
  - Higher occurrence of severe acute-phase COVID-19 infection
  - Higher rates of comorbid risk factors (e.g., diabetes, autoimmune conditions, immune impairment, ...)
  - Poor accessibility of care -- especially specialist & interdisciplinary care
  - $\circ$   $\quad$  Low health literacy & challenges navigating the health system
  - Higher pre-existing rates of mental health disorders
  - Infeasibility of securing medical leave, accommodate disability

### Mythbusting: Common PCC/Long COVID Misconceptions

- Is psychosomatic in origin
- Is limited to those who experienced serious acute COVID-19 symptoms
- Is a single, monolithic condition
- Exhibits a unstructured, scattershot collection of symptoms
- Consists of symptoms that originate in acute phase and resolve over time
- Imposes burden limited to bearing with such symptoms
- Is a squishy set of nuisance symptoms medicalized by the privileged
- Is adequately captured in administrative databases and electronic health records



Image from: Lopez-Leon, S., Wegman-Ostrosky, T., Perelman, C., Sepulveda, R., Rebolledo, P.A., Cuapio, A. and Villapol, S., 2021. More than 50 Long-term effects of COVID-19: a systematic review and meta-analysis. Available at

https://www.medrxiv.org/content/medrxiv/early/2021/01/29/2021.01.27.21250617.full.pdf



### Elevated Risk of Diverse Symptoms After 3+ months (Adults&Kids)



Age group ---- Adults -- -- Children and adolescents

The elevation of risk of adults (red) and children (blue) suffering a wide variety of symptoms 3+ months after COVID- infection across diverse domains and organ systems.

This image is taken from: Roessler, M., Tesch, F., Batram, M., Jacob, J., Loser, F., Weidinger, O., Wende, D., Vivirito, A., Toepfner, N., Seifert, M. and Nagel, O., 2021. Post COVID-19 in children, adolescents, and adults: results of a matched cohort study including more than 150,000 individuals with COVID-19. MedRxiv. The article is accessible at the following address <a href="https://www.medrxiv.org/content/10.1101/2021.10.21.21265133v1.full?s=08">https://www.medrxiv.org/content/10.1101/2021.10.21.21265133v1.full?s=08</a>

### Prevalence of specific symptoms amongst Canadians w/PCCs

Symptoms	Percent reporting symptom (95% confidence interval)
fatigue, tiredness or loss of energy	72.1% (68.1%, 75.8%)
coughing	39.3% (35.0%, 43.8%)
shortness of breath or difficulty breathing	38.5% (34.2%, 43.0%)
difficulty thinking or problem solving (brain fog)	32.9% (28.9%, 37.0%)
general weakness	30.9% (27.1%, 34.9%)
headache	29.7% (26.1%, 33.5%)
loss of taste or smell	27.9% (23.3%, 33.1%)
stress or anxiety	24.2% (20.9%, 27.9%)
pain (e.g., muscular, abdominal, joint)	22.8% (19.6%, 26.3%)
sadness, pessimism, hopelessness or depression	18.8% (15.7%, 22.3%)
chest pain	17.0% (13.9%, 20.5%)
symptoms relating to the heart (e.g., fast, pounding or irregular heartbeat)	11.8% (9.1%, 15.1%)
fever	10.1% (8.1%, 12.5%)

Image from COVID-19: Longer-term symptoms among Canadian adults - First report (Fall 2022) <u>https://health-infobase.canada.ca/covid-19/post-covid-condition/fall-2022-report.html</u>

Multi-organ complications of covid-19 and long covid.



the**bmj** 

### Neurological sequelae

Image & text from Xu, E., Xie, Y. & AI-Aly, Z. Long-term neurologic outcomes of COVID-19. *Nat Med* (2022). https://doi.org/10.1038/s41591-022-02001-z

Strong concerns exist about the added burden of dementia

#### nature medicine

Explore content v About the journal v Publish with us v

nature > nature medicine > articles > article

Article Open Access Published: 22 September 2022

#### Long-term neurologic outcomes of COVID-19

Evan Xu, Yan Xie & Ziyad Al-Aly 🖂

Nature Medicine (2022) Cite this article 124k Accesses 5873 Altmetric Metrics

#### Abstract

The neurologic manifestations of acute COVID-19 are well characterized, but a comprehensive evaluation of postacute neurologic sequelae at 1 year has not been undertaken. Here we use the national healthcare databases of the US Department of Veterans Affairs to build a cohort of 154,068 individuals with COVID-19, 5,638,795 contemporary controls and 5,859,621 historical controls; we use inverse probability weighting to balance the cohorts, and estimate risks and burdens of incident neurologic disorders at 12 months following acute SARS-CoV-2 infection. Our results show that in the postacute phase of COVID-19, there was increased risk of an array of incident neurologic sequelae including ischemic and hemorrhagic stroke, cognition and memory disorders, peripheral nervous system disorders, episodic disorders (for example, migraine and seizures), extrapyramidal and movement disorders, mental health disorders, musculoskeletal disorders, sensory disorders, Guillain-Barré syndrome, and encephalitis or encephalopathy. We estimated that the hazard ratio of any neurologic sequela was 1.42 (95% confidence intervals 1.38, 1.47) and burden 70.69 (95% confidence intervals 63.54, 78.01) per 1,000 persons at 12 months. The risks and burdens were elevated even in people who did not require hospitalization during acute COVID-19. Limitations include a cohort comprising mostly White males. Taken together, our results provide evidence of increased risk of long-term neurologic disorders in people who had COVID-19.

## Worsened Dysglycemia

Risk for Newly Diagnosed Diabetes >30 Days After SARS-CoV-2 Infection Among Persons Aged <18 Years — United States, March 1, 2020–June 28, 2021

Weekly / January 14, 2022 / 71(2);59-65

On January 7, 2022, this report was posted online as an MMWR Early Release.

Catherine E. Barrett, PhD<sup>1,2</sup>; Alain K. Koyama, ScD<sup>1,2</sup>; Pablo Alvarez, MPH<sup>1</sup>; Wilson Chow<sup>1</sup>; Elizabeth A. Lundeen, PhD<sup>1,2</sup>; Cria G. Perrine, PhD<sup>1</sup>; Meda E. Pavkov, MD, PhD<sup>2</sup>; Deborah B. Rolka, MS<sup>2</sup>; Jennifer L. Wiltz, MD<sup>1</sup>; Lara Bull-Otterson, PhD<sup>1</sup>; Simone Gray, PhD<sup>1</sup>; Tegan K. Boehmer, PhD<sup>1</sup>; Adi V. Gundlapalli, MD<sup>1</sup>; David A. Siegel, MD<sup>1</sup>; Lyudmyla Kompaniyets, PhD<sup>1</sup>; Alyson B. Goodman, MD<sup>1</sup>; Barbara E. Mahon, MD<sup>1</sup>; Robert V. Tauxe, MD<sup>1</sup>; Karen Remley, MD<sup>1</sup>; Sharon Saydah, PhD<sup>1</sup> (<u>View author affiliations</u>)

#### View suggested citation

#### Summary

#### What is already known about this topic?

SARS-CoV-2 infection is associated with worsening of diabetes symptoms, and persons with diabetes are at increased risk for severe COVID-19. SARS-CoV-2 infection might also induce newly diagnosed diabetes.

#### What is added by this report?

Persons aged <18 years with COVID-19 were more likely to receive a new diabetes diagnosis >30 days after infection than were those without COVID-19 and those with prepandemic acute respiratory infections. Non–SARS-CoV-2 respiratory infection was not associated with an increased risk for diabetes.

#### What are the implications for public health practice?

The increased diabetes risk among persons aged <18 years following COVID-19 highlights the importance of COVID-19 prevention strategies in this age group, including vaccination for all eligible persons and chronic disease prevention and treatment.

#### Article Metrics



Image & article from Barrett CE, Koyama AK, Alvarez P, et al. Risk for Newly Diagnosed Diabetes >30 Days After SARS-CoV-2 Infection Among Persons Aged <18 Years — United States, March 1, 2020–June 28, 2021. MMWR Morb Mortal Wkly Rep 2022;71:59–65. DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.15585/ mmwr.mm7102e2external icon

#### nature immunology

Explore content v About the journal v Publish with us v

nature > nature immunology > letters > article

#### Letter Published: 13 January 2022

# Immunological dysfunction persists for 8 months following initial mild-to-moderate SARS-CoV-2 infection

Chansavath Phetsouphanh ⊠, David R. Darley, Daniel B. Wilson, Annett Howe, C. Mee Ling Munier, Sheila K. Patel, Jennifer A. Juno, Louise M. Burrell, Stephen J. Kent, Gregory J. Dore, Anthony D. Kelleher ⊠ & Gail V. Matthews ⊠

Nature Immunology (2022) | Cite this article **43k** Accesses | **2900** Altmetric | Metrics

#### Abstract

A proportion of patients surviving acute coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19) infection develop post-acute COVID syndrome (long COVID (LC)) lasting longer than 12 weeks. Here, we studied individuals with LC compared to age- and gender-matched recovered individuals without LC, unexposed donors and individuals infected with other coronaviruses. Patients with LC had highly activated innate immune cells, lacked naive T and B cells and showed elevated expression of type I IFN (IFN- $\beta$ ) and type III IFN (IFN- $\lambda$ 1) that remained persistently high at 8 months after infection. Using a log-linear classification model, we defined an optimal set of analytes that had the strongest association with LC among the 28 analytes measured. Combinations of the inflammatory mediators IFN- $\beta$ , PTX3, IFN- $\gamma$ , IFN- $\lambda$ 2/3 and IL-6 associated with LC with 78.5–81.6% accuracy. This work defines immunological

#### Image & text from

Phetsouphanh, C., Darley, D.R., Wilson, D.B. *et al.* Immunological dysfunction persists for 8 months following initial mild-to-moderate SARS-CoV-2 infection. *Nat Immunol* (2022). <u>https://doi.org/10.1038/s41590-021-01113-x</u>

### Marked Mortality Differential within 1<sup>st</sup> Year Post-infection



Source: Mainous III, A.G., Rooks, B.J., Wu, V. and Orlando, F.A., 2021. COVID-19 Post-acute Sequelae Among Adults: 12 Month Mortality Risk. Frontiers in Medicine, p.2351. https://www.frontiersin.org/articles/10.3389/fmed.2021.778434/full

### Mythbusting: Common PCC/Long COVID Misconceptions

### • Is psychosomatic in origin

- Is limited to those who experienced serious acute COVID-19 symptoms
- Is a single, monolithic condition
- Exhibits a unstructured, scattershot collection of symptoms
- Consists of symptoms that originate in acute phase and resolve over time
- Imposes burden limited to bearing with such symptoms
- Is a squishy set of nuisance symptoms medicalized by the privileged
- Is adequately captured in administrative databases and electronic health records



**Image from** Hector Fabio Bonilla & Linda N. Geng. Long COVID: An Update and the Stanford PACS Clinic. Stanford University Department of Medicine Grand Rounds. Jan 12 2022 <u>https://youtu.be/jbc\_NhIRgcM</u>

### Symptom Severity

	(	) 6	(	06	(	06	(	06		0 6		0 6	(	0 6		06		0 6	(	06		
SOR	nowSev	***	***	·····	***	***	***	***	***	***	***	***	***	***	***	***	***		***	·····	***	= ∞
Couch	50266	ghNows	***	0.01	0.43 ***	0.39 ***	***	***	***	***	0.43 ***	0.49 ***	0.52	0.42 ***	***	0.53	0.49 ***	0.57	0.53	0.57	0.57 ***	0
loin+Pain		ഹെല്ലം	0.29	0.45	0.20	0.20	0.27	0.28	0.20	0.20	0.27	0.23	0.31	0.19	0.20	0.31	0.25	0.29	0.28	0.30	0.33	= ∞
ChostPain			80.0	0.42	0.36	0.36	0.47	0.34	0.30	0.32	0.45	0.42	0.44	0.36	0.38	0.54	0.37	0.56	0.46	0.51	0.49	0
HogentBalnitations					0.53	0.32	0.42	0.41	0.24	0.33	0.41	0.40	0.41	0.33	0.41	0.48	0.46	0.48	0.41	0.50	0.53	_
Depression	P					*** 0.31	*** 0.39	*** 0.31	*** 0.25	*** 0.25	*** 0.40	0.43	*** 0.43	*** 0.44	*** 0.38	0.46	0.44	0.46	*** 0.44	*** 0.46	*** 0.47	8 0
Depression				Rese		ssionNo	*** 0.36	*** 0.28	*** 0.27	*** 0.20	*** 0.45	0.52	*** 0.53	0.62	0.65	0.55	*** 0.33	*** 0.43	0.50	*** 0.44	*** 0.45	
Headaches		6		6			chesNow	*** 0.32	*** 0.30	*** 0.29	*** 0.47	*** 0.48	*** 0.48	*** 0.44	*** 0.39	<b>***</b> 0.56	*** 0.38	*** 0.52	*** 0.48	*** 0.46	*** 0.47	
Fever								erNowW	*** 0.35	*** 0.21	*** 0.32	*** 0.28	*** 0.32	*** 0.28	<b>***</b> 0.30	*** 0.33	*** 0.32	*** 0.37	*** 0.35	*** 0.39	*** 0.36	- 0
Rash								1988 C	shNowS	***	*** 0.28	*** 0.26	*** 0.29	*** 0.28	*** 0.28	*** 0.31	***	*** 0.31	*** 0.32	*** 0.33	<b>***</b> 0.30	_ ∞
HairLoss		0880 0880	R.				<b>6.6</b> 80	838	680	mellNov	***	***	***	***	***	***	***	***	***	***	***	- 0
LossOfSmell		ьa. ППФ									eepNov	***	***	***	***	***	***	***	***	***	***	= ∞
SleepIssues		000	<b>X</b>				,					0.54 EmoryNo	0.56	0.54	0.51	0.63	0.41	0.53	0.54	0.53	0.55	0
MemoryIssues					Po					123			0.85	0.59	0.63	0.73	0.52	0.62	0.74	0.65	0.63	
BrainFog					A Bo			B	000				BEINOW	0.62	0.64	0.76	0.55	0.66	0.78	0.72	0.68	8 0
Anxiety														xietyNo	0.66	0.59	0.39	0.49	0.59	<b>***</b> 0.49	*** 0.49	
MoodIssues													80		loodNov	0.60	*** 0.46	*** 0.53	0.62	0.58	0.58	8
PhysicalFatique				1000	<b>A</b>	Real Providence		B							100	atigueNo	0.60	0.74	0.78	0.78	0.75	- 0
DeadHeavyFeeling	B			<b>1</b> 00				B					M				PeadNov	0.65	0.62	0.74	0.73	_ ∞
Soreness					معمر	The second								تحريب			2910	oreNow	0.74	0.81	0.82	- 0
MentalFatique													S	مر م				Lau	entalNo	0.76	0 77	_ ∞
ExhaustionAfterMi	r										$ \leq $	) 2 2 2 2 2 3			M					nExNov	0.11	0
FeelingDrained				660							<u>_</u> 22										U.88 ainedNo	= ∞
reeringbrutneu							<b>P</b>			6	م م			6								0
	0 6	(	) 6	(	) 6	(	) 6		0 6		0 6		0 6	(	) 6		0 6		0 6	(	0 6	

## **Principal Components: Factor Loadings &** Factor Lossen Variance explained Broad, particularly fatigue & brain fog Memory without respiratory&cardiac Mental Health&Affective

PC1 PC2 PC3 PC4 PC5 PC8 PC6 PC7 2.981 1.28664 1.18036 1.08008 0.97998 0.96534 0.91826 0.90632 Standard deviation Proportion of Variance 0.404 0.07525 0.06333 0.05303 0.04365 0.04236 0.03833 0.03734 Cumulative Proportion 0.404 0.47923 0.54256 0.59559 0.63924 0.68160 0.71993 0.75726

	PC1	PC2	PC3	PC4	PC5	PC6	PC7	PC8
SOB	0.1860101	-0.331353058	-0.035783093	0.3869155901	-0.0439615909	0.10722839	-0.0863059178	0.041969414
Cough	0.0957892	-0.429408939	-0.012301606	0.1211855536	-0.2370570673	0.56842010	-0.2810989585	0.011419775
JointPain	0.1961486	-0.223059209	0.003380971	-0.1311745818	-0.2541909603	-0.18691673	0.0102959333	-0.392364147
ChestPain	0.1896466	-0.439921170	-0.024004604	0.2155995089	0.1512032349	-0.18492141	-0.1001264324	0.103714344
HeartPalpitations	0.1663005	-0.222794870	0.062868471	0.0986604108	0.4618412558	-0.48446381	-0.2104501106	0.086504022
Depression	0.1972633	0.116893507	0.434037746	0.1361222265	-0.0171567485	0.10305590	0.2304376235	0.125507250
Headaches	0.2025930	-0.049578509	0.045841718	-0.2520330553	-0.0765720582	-0.25988468	-0.0628113256	-0.503928817
Fever	0.1497972	-0.355505931	0.122214883	-0.2483859139	-0.0351462576	0.07836071	0.4206283816	0.004257941
Rash	0.1344617	-0.181135232	0.270190120	-0.4366791191	-0.0089911908	0.05909273	0.3106814446	0.277165495
HairLoss	0.1079522	0.023703031	0.071569382	-0.5656730691	0.3460968455	0.25965968	-0.4959289493	0.118123394
LossOfSmell	0.1109121	-0.001604897	-0.236803572	-0.1983915732	-0.5943440740	-0.34943030	-0.2536415768	0.527573798
SleepIssues	0.2242126	-0.042247818	0.170223076	-0.0541496285	-0.0547156136	0.02630673	-0.1183727727	-0.174814893
MemoryIssues	0.2423882	0.273435837	0.103624877	0.0961683274	-0.0265564798	0.06963359	-0.2428550909	-0.091166585
BrainFog	0.2667048	0.215867654	0.045769517	0.0673187859	-0.0936471301	0.14355985	-0.1690658544	-0.058807207
Anxiety	0.2171701	0.097652159	0.391968439	0.1133761743	0.0004428418	-0.15171328	-0.0978244309	0.167162127
MoodIssues	0.2322922	0.186984691	0.293061164	0.1846592760	-0.0660573393	-0.02888072	0.0864887847	0.164889875
PhysicalFatigue	0.2802530	0.124049039	-0.101398872	0.0001929006	0.0267607322	0.07899934	-0.0007339593	-0.178230820
DeadHeavyFeeling	0.2140912	0.038636303	-0.334257800	-0.0130278450	0.3600027057	0.09393661	0.1298743820	0.214861842
Soreness	0.2704886	0.075423843	-0.247619225	-0.0494358908	-0.0551237184	-0.06861797	0.1385160274	-0.082887022
MentalFatigue	0.2748061	0.200862878	-0.083577520	-0.0079923589	-0.0555352475	0.05030161	0.0256038129	0.021083546
ExhaustionAfterMinimalExercise	0.2810838	0.053106445	-0.304592028	-0.0091600218	0.0624135920	0.09057739	0.1918658676	0.032754713
FeelingDrained	0.2763203	0.060187809	-0.299968121	0.0444995632	0.0585486966	0.06111320	0.1618333309	0.057578634

### Acute Infection Severity based on Symptom Severity PCA



### Mythbusting: Common PCC/Long COVID Misconceptions

#### Is psychosomatic in origin

- Is limited to those who experienced serious acute COVID-19 symptoms
- Is a single, monolithic condition
- Exhibits a unstructured, scattershot collection of symptoms
- Consists of symptoms that originate in acute phase and resolve over time
- Imposes burden limited to bearing with such symptoms
- Is a squishy set of nuisance symptoms medicalized by the privileged
- Is adequately captured in administrative databases and electronic health records

### **Canada: Impact of Acute COVID Severity on Risk of PCC**

Figure 6: Percent of Adults (Aged 18+) Self-reporting Longer-term Symptoms after a positive COVID-19 Test or Suspected Infection by Selected Risk Factors, Canada, January 2020 to August 2022



Source: PHAC, StatsCan & CITF, Associations between Longer-term Symptoms after COVID-19 and Sociodemographics, Health Characteristics, Period of Infection, and Vaccination Status in Canadian Adults, January 2020 to August 2022 (March 2023) <a href="https://health-infobase.canada.ca/src/doc/post-covid-condition/Association-Between-Longer-term-Symptoms-after-COVID-19.pdf">https://health-infobase.canada.ca/src/doc/post-covid-condition/Association-Between-Longer-term-Symptoms-after-COVID-19.pdf</a>

## Symptom Severity by Reported Acute Severity



Symptom Severity (Now) Reported by Participants
## Mythbusting: Common PCC/Long COVID Misconceptions

- Is psychosomatic in origin
- Is limited to those who experienced serious acute COVID-19 symptoms
- Is a single, monolithic condition
- Exhibits a unstructured, scattershot collection of symptoms
- Consists of symptoms that originate in acute phase and resolve over time
- Imposes burden limited to bearing with such symptoms
- Is a squishy set of nuisance symptoms medicalized by the privileged
- Is adequately captured in administrative databases and electronic health records



#### % of Canadians with Pre-Existing Conditions Experiencing PCC after COVID-19 Infection

Source: Canadian COVID-19 Antibody and Health Survey-Cycle 2.

Note: Longer-term symptoms are defined as self-reported persistent, recurring, or new symptoms 3 or more months after a positive COVID-19 test or suspected infection. Chronic conditions were defined as health conditions expected to last or lasting 6 months or more that were diagnosed by a health professional. Respondents can report more than one chronic condition. A total of 21 chronic conditions were examined. Chronic conditions with too few respondents to report include: Alzheimer's disease or other dementia, and liver disease. Estimates exclude the territories. CFS = chronic fatious syndrome, COVID-19 = Coronavirus Disease 2019.

Source: PHAC, StatsCan & CITF, Associations between Longer-term Symptoms after COVID-19 and Sociodemographics, Health Characteristics, Period of Infection, and Vaccination Status in Canadian Adults, January 2020 to August 2022 (March 2023) <a href="https://health-infobase.canada.ca/src/doc/post-covid-condition/Association-Between-Longer-term-Symptoms-after-COVID-19.pdf">https://health-infobase.canada.ca/src/doc/post-covid-condition/Association-Between-Longer-term-Symptoms-after-COVID-19.pdf</a>

#### Cell

#### Multiple early factors anticipate post-acute COVID-19 sequelae

#### **Graphical abstract**



#### Authors

Yapeng Su, Dan Yuan, Daniel G. Chen, ..., Mark M. Davis, Jason D. Goldman, James R. Heath

#### Correspondence

suyapeng.tju@gmail.com (Y.S.), jason.goldman@swedish.org (J.D.G.), jim.heath@isbscience.org (J.R.H.)

#### In brief

By correlating patient symptoms with indepth profiling of blood cells and plasma components throughout COVID-19 infection, this study identifies factors that may predict sustained disease.

#### Highlights

- Longitudinal multi-omics associate PASC with autoantibodies, viremia, and comorbidities
- Reactivation of latent visuana during initial infaction may

Su, Y., Yuan, D., Chen, D.G., Ng, R.H., Wang, K., Choi, J., Li, S., Hong, S., Zhang, R., Xie, J. and Kornilov, S.A., 2022. Multiple early factors anticipate post-acute COVID-19 sequelae. *Cell*, *185*(5), pp.881-895.

## % of Canadians with Counts of Pre-Existing Conditions Experiencing PCC after COVID-19 Infection

Source: PHAC, StatsCan & CITF, Associations between Longer-term Symptoms after COVID-19 and Sociodemographics, Health Characteristics, Period of Infection, and Vaccination Status in Canadian Adults, January 2020 to August 2022 (March 2023)

https://health-infobase.canada.ca/src/doc/post-covid-condition/Association-Betwe en-Longer-term-Symptoms-after-COVID-19.pdf **Figure 3:** Percent of Adults (Aged 18+) Self-reporting Longer-term Symptoms after a Positive COVID-19 Test or Suspected Infection by Number of Selected Chronic Conditions Present Pre-infection, Canada, January 2020 to August 2022



Source: Canadian COVID-19 Antibody and Health Survey-Cycle 2.

Note: Longer-term symptoms are defined as self-reported persistent, recurring, or new symptoms 3 or more months after a positive COVID-19 test or suspected infection. Chronic conditions were defined as health conditions expected to last or lasting 6 months or more that were diagnosed by a health professional. See the technical notes for the list of 21 conditions examined. Estimates exclude the territories. COVID-19 = Coronavirus Disease 2019.

## **Activity Limitations amongst Canadians with PCC**

How often daily activities were limited	Percent reporting level of limitation (95% confidence interval)
never	16.9% (14.1%, 20.2%)
rarely	29.4% (25.5%, 33.7%)
sometimes	32.3% (28.6%, 36.3%)
often	15.7% (12.9%, 18.9%)
always	5.6% (4.1%, 7.6%)

Amongst those with paid job or attending school, 74.1% (95% CI: 69.3%, 78.3%) reported absences Image from COVID-19: Longer-term symptoms among Canadian adults - First report (Fall 2022) <u>https://health-infobase.canada.ca/covid-19/post-covid-condition/fall-2022-report.html</u>

# Functional Limitations of LC Participants by Reported Acute COVID Severity



# **Debilitating Conditions**

Fatigue	"I could doa kids' puzzle for 15 minutes, and I would have to rest physically and cognitively for 14 hours and try again the next day." (F6)
Tachycardia/ Hypotension	"Any time I rise or change position, my heart rate goes really high, 140 usually, and then my blood pressure dropsevery time I stand up, every time I get moving. And then it causes dizziness, nausea, all those fun symptoms." (F1)
Dyspnea	<i>"It would take me an hour to walk up the flight of stairs and back down'cause I was so short of breath"</i> (F5)
Sleep Problems	<i>"I'll sleep for 20 minutes and then I'll be awake …when you add that all up, it's like three hours of sleep I've had, but all broken up."</i> (F10)

Adapted from Donna Goodridge

## Mythbusting: Common PCC/Long COVID Misconceptions

#### • Is psychosomatic in origin

- Is limited to those who experienced serious acute COVID-19 symptoms
- Is a single, monolithic condition
- Exhibits a unstructured, scattershot collection of symptoms
- Consists of symptoms that originate in acute phase and resolve over time
- Imposes burden limited to bearing with such symptoms
- Is a squishy set of nuisance symptoms medicalized by the privileged
- Is adequately captured in administrative databases and electronic health records

## Association with Vaccination History (Count)

Source: PHAC, StatsCan & CITF, Associations between Longer-term Symptoms after COVID-19 and Sociodemographics, Health Characteristics, Period of Infection, and Vaccination Status in Canadian Adults, January 2020 to August 2022 (March 2023) <u>https://health-infobase.canada.ca/src/doc/post-covid-condition/Associatio</u> <u>n-Between-Longer-term-Symptoms-after-COVID-19.pdf</u> **Figure 8:** Percent of Adults (Aged 18+) Self-reporting Longer-term Symptoms after a Positive COVID-19 Test or Suspected Infection by Number of COVID-19 Vaccine Doses Received Prior to Infection, Canada, January 2020 to August 2022



Source: Canadian COVID-19 Antibody and Health Survey—Cycle 2. Note: Longer-term symptoms are defined as self-reported persistent, recurring, or new symptoms 3 or more months after a positive COVID-19 test or suspected infection. Estimates exclude the territories. COVID-19 = Coronavirus Disease 2019.



**Figure 1.** Frequency of most reported symptoms among the uninfected, the vaccinated and the unvaccinated Image from: Kuodi, P., Gorelik, Y., Zayyad, H., Wertheim, O., Wiegler, K.B., Jabal, K.A., Dror, A., Nazzal, S., Glikman, D. and Edelstein, M., 2022. Association between vaccination status and reported incidence of post-acute COVID-19 symptoms in Israel: a cross-sectional study of patients infected between March 2020 and November 2021. *medRxiv*.

Long COVID after breakthrough SARS-CoV-2 infection (al-Aly et al. Nature Med , May 25, 2022)

US Veterans Affairs cohort (n=33,940) including vaccinated persons with breakthrough infections and controls without evidence of SARS-CoV-2 infection

6 months post-infection, compared to controls, higher risk of death (HR 1.75, CI 1.59-1.93), incident post-acute sequalae ICV, coagulation and hematological, GI, kidney, mental health, MSK and neurological disorders)

Compared to unvaccinated persons with SARS-CoV-02, those with BTI exhibited lower risk of death (HR 0.66, CI 0.58-.074) and incident post-acute sequelae (HR 0.85, CI 0.82-.89)

Vaccination before infection confers only partial protection in the post-acute phase of the disease – Must optimize prevention of BTI and develop post-acute care pathways

## Mythbusting: Common PCC/Long COVID Misconceptions

#### Is psychosomatic in origin

- Is limited to those who experienced serious acute COVID-19 symptoms
- Is a single, monolithic condition
- Exhibits a unstructured, scattershot collection of symptoms
- Consists of symptoms that originate in acute phase and resolve over time
- Imposes burden limited to bearing with such symptoms
- Is a squishy set of nuisance symptoms medicalized by the privileged
- Is adequately captured in administrative databases and electronic health records

**Figure 7:** Percent of Adults (Aged 18+) Self-reporting Longer-term Symptoms after a Positive COVID-19 Test or Suspected Infection by Time Period of Infection, Canada, January 2020 to August 2022



Source: Canadian COVID-19 Antibody and Health Survey-Cycle 2.

Note: Longer-term symptoms are defined as self-reported persistent, recurring, or new symptoms 3 or more months after a positive COVID-19 test or suspected infection. Infections occurring within 3 months of August 31, 2022 are excluded because of an insufficient post-infection period to assess longer-term symptoms. Estimates exclude the territories. COVID-19 = Coronavirus Disease 2019.

Source: PHAC, StatsCan & CITF, Associations between Longer-term Symptoms after COVID-19 and Sociodemographics, Health Characteristics, Period of Infection, and Vaccination Status in Canadian Adults, January 2020 to August 2022 (March 2023) <a href="https://health-infobase.canada.ca/src/doc/post-covid-condition/Association-Between-Longer-term-Symptoms-after-COVID-19.pdf">https://health-infobase.canada.ca/src/doc/post-covid-condition/Association-Between-Longer-term-Symptoms-after-COVID-19.pdf</a>

## Symptom Duration amongst PCC Canadians Infected ≥ 1 yr

Duration of symptoms	Percent reporting duration (95% confidence interval)
less than 2 months	11.3% (7.1%, 17.5%)
between 2 months and less than 3 months	8.6% (5.3%, 13.6%)
between 3 months and less than 6 months	21.9% (16.3%, 28.6%)
between 6 months and less than 1 year	11.1% (7.9%, 15.2%)
1 year or longer	47.3% (40.3%, 54.3%)

Amongst those with paid job or attending school, 74.1% (95% CI: 69.3%, 78.3%) reported absences Image from COVID-19: Longer-term symptoms among Canadian adults - First report (Fall 2022) <u>https://health-infobase.canada.ca/covid-19/post-covid-condition/fall-2022-report.html</u> Disability is likely to account for the lion's share of COVID-19's burden, and might disproportionately affect women, especially those who were infected young.

SMITH MP. ESTIMATING TOTAL MORBIDITY BURDEN OF COVID-10: RELATIVE IMPORTANCE OF DEATH AND DISABILITY. *J CLIN EPI* 2022:142;54-59.

Source: Donna Goodridge

#### **Only SALC Participants**



Scatterplot of Time Since Infection vs. Symptom Counts



Base symptoms only

Additional symptoms Included



#### Boxplots of Participants' Self-Reported Severity of Depression Over Estimated Months Since Infection

Discrete Estimated Months Since Infection

# The Process of Adaptation

- Grieving Losses "I'm missing out on being a mom, like for my 18-month-old. I can be a mom, bits and pieces. I've missed out on so many activities." (F1)
- •Considering the Prospect of Permanent Disability "Some of the questions my mom has posed to me is like trying to get me thinking about what happens if this doesn't go away. What happens if I'm at 60% forever?" (F2)
- •Living with Relapses "It cycles. You're good for a couple of days and then I walk too far because I'm trying to get more exercise because that's what my doctor said to do, and it sets me back for two days, your joints hurt, it hurts to sit, it hurts to stand up." (F10)
- Transformed identities "I have always defined myself for working and volunteering and being there for everybody else, and now I can't, and it's been very hard for me." (F6)

Adapted from: Donna Goodridge

## Cumulative Impacts of Reinfection Risks

Bowe, B., Xie, Y. & Al-Aly, Z. Acute and postacute sequelae associated with SARS-CoV-2 reinfection. Nat Med 28, 2398–2405 (2022). https://doi.org/10.1038/s41591-022-02051-3 https://www.nature.com/articles/s41591-022-02051-3

#### nature medicine

Explore content Y About the journal Y Publish with us Y

nature > nature medicine > articles > article

Article Open Access Published: 10 November 2022

#### Acute and postacute sequelae associated with SARS-CoV-2 reinfection

Benjamin Bowe, Yan Xie & Ziyad Al-Aly 🖂

 Nature Medicine
 28, 2398–2405 (2022)
 Cite this article

 569k
 Accesses
 43
 Citations
 14900
 Altmetric
 Metrics

#### Abstract

First infection with severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus 2 (SARS-CoV-2) is associated with increased risk of acute and postacute death and sequelae in various organ systems. Whether reinfection adds to risks incurred after first infection is unclear. Here we used the US Department of Veterans Affairs' national healthcare database to build a cohort of individuals with one SARS-CoV-2 infection (n = 443,588), reinfection (two or more infections, n = 40,947) and a noninfected control (n = 5,334,729). We used inverse probability-weighted survival models to estimate risks and 6-month burdens of death, hospitalization and incident sequelae. Compared to no reinfection, reinfection contributed additional risks of death (hazard ratio (HR) = 2.17, 95% confidence intervals (Cl) 1.93–2.45), hospitalization (HR = 3.32, 95% Cl 3.13–3.51) and sequelae including pulmonary, cardiovascular, hematological, diabetes, gastrointestinal, kidney, mental health, musculoskeletal and neurological disorders. The risks were evident regardless of vaccination status. The risks were most pronounced in the acute phase but persisted in the postacute phase at 6 months. Compared to noninfected controls, cumulative risks and burdens of repeat infection increased according to the number of

## Mythbusting: Common PCC/Long COVID Misconceptions

- Is psychosomatic in origin
- Is limited to those who experienced serious acute COVID-19 symptoms
- Is a single, monolithic condition
- Exhibits a unstructured, scattershot collection of symptoms
- Consists of symptoms that originate in acute phase and resolve over time
- Imposes burden limited to bearing with such symptoms
- Is a squishy set of nuisance symptoms medicalized by the privileged
- Is adequately captured in administrative databases and electronic health records

## Mythbusting: Common PCC/Long COVID Misconceptions

- Is psychosomatic in origin
- Is limited to those who experienced serious acute COVID-19 symptoms
- Is a single, monolithic condition
- Exhibits a unstructured, scattershot collection of symptoms
- Consists of symptoms that originate in acute phase and resolve over time
- Imposes burden limited to bearing with such symptoms
- Is a squishy set of nuisance symptoms medicalized by the privileged
- Is adequately captured in administrative databases and electronic health records



# Good advice is hard to come by...

- The scarcity of good advice has often left people with LONG COVID feeling isolated and frustrated in the search for therapies
- •Self-prescribing practices in Long COVID are unsurprisingly high
- •A vast range of OTC medicines, remedies, supplements, and dietary practices are being used because people are willing to try almost anything
- •Advice on the internet and social media can be conflicting and a source of misinformation

Brown et al. Long COVID and self-management. Lancet 2022. https://www.thelancet.com/action/showPdf?pii=S0140-6736%28 21%2902798-7

#### Source: Donna Goodridge

## High-Burden Symptom: Brain Fog

#### **Brain Fog**

	COVID and LC	COVID No LC	Don't Know LC	No COVID
	(n= 290)	(n=76)	(n=26)	(n=247)
Prevalence	80.56% (n= 288 )	36.49% (n= 74)	61.11% (n= 18)	23.24% (n= 241 )
Worse after COVID	96.98% (n= 232 )	62.96% (n= 27)	27.27% (n= 11)	1.79% (n= 56 )
Worst Severity Average	7.36 (n=232)	4.74 (n=27)	$5.36 \ (n=11)$	$4.14 \ (n=56)$
Severity Now Average	4.94 (n=232)	$2.30 \ (n=27)$	3.73 (n = 11)	2.36 (n = 56)
Seen HCP	44.83% (n= 232)	14.81% (n= 27)	9.09% (n= 11)	16.07% (n= 56 )
Satisified with care	27.88% (n= 104)	75.00% (n= 4)	0.00% (n= 1 )	66.67% (n= 9)

## **High-Burden Symptom: Memory Issues**

Memory Issues

	COVID and LC	COVID No LC	Don't Know LC	No COVID
	(n= 290)	(n=76)	(n=26)	(n=247)
Prevalence	82.35% (n= 289 )	39.19% (n= 74)	50.00% (n= 18)	30.71% (n= 241 )
Worse after COVID	95.78% (n= 237 )	51.72% (n= 29 )	22.22% (n= 9 )	1.35% (n= 74 )
Worst Severity Average	7.07 (n=237)	4.14 (n=29)	6.33 (n=9)	4.07 (n=74)
Severity Now Average	5.23 (n=237)	2.34 (n=29)	4.89 (n=9)	2.66 (n = 74)
Seen HCP	44.30% (n= 237)	24.14% (n= 29)	11.11% (n= 9)	20.27% (n= 74)
Satisified with care	34.29% (n= 105)	71.43% (n= 7)	100.00% (n=1)	86.67% (n= 15 )

## **Post-Exertional Malaise**

#### **Tired After Minimal Exercise**

	COVID and LC	COVID No LC	Don't Know LC	No COVID
	(n=290)	(n=76)	(n=26)	(n=247)
Prevalence	73.52% (n= 287)	29.73% (n= 74)	27.78% (n= 18)	13.69% (n= 241 )
Worse after COVID	99.05% (n= 211 )	77.27% (n= 22)	20.00% (n= 5 )	3.03% (n= 33 )
Worst Severity Average	7.75 (n=211)	4.68 (n=22)	$5.00 \ (n=5)$	4.85 (n=33)
Severity Now Average	5.45 (n=211)	1.91 (n=22)	$3.00 \ (n=5)$	2.58 (n=33)
Seen HCP	49.76% (n= 211)	13.64% (n= 22)	40.00% (n= 5)	24.24% (n= 33)
Satisified with care	31.43% (n= 105)	100.00% (n= 3)	50.00% (n= $2$ )	62.50% (n= 8)

After performing activities...

	COVID and LC	COVID No LC	Don't Know LC	No COVID
	(n=290)	(n=76)	(n=26)	(n=247)
Recovered within an hour	47.90% (n= 286 )	93.15% (n= 73 )	94.44% (n= 18 )	88.75% (n= 240)
Worsened fatigue	68.88% (n= 286 )	15.07% (n= 73 )	38.89% (n= 18 )	5.44% (n= 239 )
Worsened mental capability	67.48% (n= 286 )	16.44% (n= 73 )	50.00% (n= 18 )	12.13% (n= 239 )

# Focus **Groups for People with Symptoms** of Long COVID

41 individuals from 8 Canadian provinces participated in 10 focus groups in February/March 2022.

#### •Sample quotes:

He was a young emergency doctor filling in to do this assessment. Took five minutes and didn't – hadn't even read my chart, didn't look at my echo result. Was just like, "I think antidepressants are the answer." And so right then, I was, like, you absolutely are incorrect and this isn't a depression. You know, I've monitored my heart rate, monitored my oxygen. And it's almost like POTS-like symptoms. I'm like, I'm not making it up in my head. And yeah, it's been terrible.

I find my whole nervous system is just feels like jacked up, like lights, lights are too bright, sounds are too loud. Everything smells too – it's just, the whole – I feel like my whole nervous system is jacked right up to the nines.

Source: Donna Goodridge

# Provider and Relational Factors Contributing to Erosion of Trust

• Feelings of Abandonment "Just imagine you're in the middle of the ocean without a life jacket and you're struggling to keep your head afloat. And a boat comes by and start clapping at you and says, "Man, you're doing a good job," and drives off." That's sort of what I feel like right now. " (F4)

• "We're drowning and we are alone" (F6)

•Expectations that providers know the answers "Physicians here are not equipped to deal with this, and I know we don't know what we don't know, we're living in real time, but it's frustrating as a person when they're supposed to be the experts." (F9)

• "They kind of ameliorate things, but you know, no one seems to know anything about really getting down to how do we cure this" (F8)

•Concerns dismissed "I've been on my own and the doctors have done nothing but gaslight me." (F6)

#### Source: Donna Goodridge

# Factors Affecting the Complex Work of Recovery

• Family support "I've had to have my husband come to all my doctors' appointments because I just can't process quick enough and answer questions and remember things." (F4)

• Frustration of having Symptoms Discredited "I'm struggling with the lack of belief. People think I'm faking all the time and I'm like, seriously? Look at my thermometer, it's 104. I'm not faking!"(F4)

#### Need for Self-Advocacy

*"I've been doing a lot of research, a lot of investigating because I've been on my own and the doctors have done nothing but gaslight me."* (F6)

"A lot of times, we're guiding what [providers] are doing, right? We're – especially because I have a medical background, so I'm researching and I'm looking and I'm doing anything I can to try to help my situation, right? Which, again, when you're going through long COVID is extremely exhausting. A lot of people don't even have the energy to be their own advocate, right?" (F8)

Adapted from Donna Goodridge

## Existing EHRs & administrative data risk missing much of the PCC burden



### Mythbusting: Common PCC/Long COVID Misconceptions

- Is psychosomatic in origin
- Is limited to those who experienced serious acute COVID 19 symptoms
- Is a single, monolithic condition
- Exhibits a unstructured, scattershot collection of symptoms
- Consists of symptoms that originate in acute phase and resolve over time
- Imposes burden limited to bearing with such symptoms
- Is a squishy set of nuisance symptoms medicalized by the privileged
- Is adequately captured in administrative databases and electronic health records

## **Prognostic Machine Learning Models**

- We have been explore the predictive accuracy of a variety of types of machine learning models
- Model classes explored include deep neural networks, Bayesian, Statistical learning & kernel methods

### **Effectiveness of Parsimonious Predictive Models**

- Extremely simple machine learning models can offer strong power in predicting Long COVID outcomes
- Example: **4 variable** model: **Acute** Severity, Sex, Vaccination status, count preexisting conditions

	AUC	Accuracy	Precision	F1-score
SVC	0.801	0.746	0.771	0.753
XGBM	0.757	0.592	0.704	0.604
Deep Neural Network	0.787	0.732	0.724	0.727

## Our Long COVID Dynamic Modeling Work

- Dynamic modeling work
  - Summer 2021 & onwards: COVID-19 Multi-jurisdiction ABM
  - Refined Long COVID-specific ABM (Nastaran Jamali)
  - Work with Ellen Rafferty et al. (Institute for Health Economics)
  - Work with Alex Doroshenko, Karsten Hempel for Alberta WCB

## Long COVID Agent-Based & Hybrid Modeling

- Saskatchewan intervention & projection-focused hybrid, spatially explicit COVID-19 ABM (summer 2021-): Clinical need progression (self-management, interdisciplinary care, specialty care)
- Long COVID ABM (CEPHIL student Nastaran Jamali)
- Joint w/Ellen Rafferty et al. (IHE): Long COVID resource utilization ABM
- Joint w/PHAC (RJ Edjoc) et al.: Cardiac Long COVID outcomes ABM

## Long COVID ABM

- Infection pathways, including reinfection
- Pre-existing conditions
- Vaccination
- For each patient, principal components-guided families of post-COVID conditions, each with
  - Severity
  - Diagnosis status
  - Treatment pathways
  - Separate timing of resolution
  - Active/inactive distinction
- Custom characterization of high-burden outcomes with unique dynamics & risk factors (e.g., diabetes, cardiovascular, depression)
- History information


## **Diabetes Statechart with initial diabetes distribution**



# **Example Outcomes 1**



▶ 🔳 🕢 (?\_ Virtual (?) 🕞 🕞

# **Example Outcomes 2**









General Population LC CardioProblems



# **Modeling Challenges**

- Reliable infection data
- Vast array of symptoms & incompletely elucidated latent classes
- Symptom-specific dynamics
- Diversity of biological pathways underlying symptoms (neurologic, dysbiosis, organ damage, immune dysregulation, psychiatric, autonomic nervous system, etc.)
- Unclear impact of reinfection
- Non-monotonic nature of evolution
- Diversity of risk factors
- Undiagnosed nature of much (most) of PCC?
- Lack of (ICD) medical coding standards
- Inter-provincial fragmentation
- Evolving & Non-additive healthcare burdens
- Limitations in longitudinal data availability

#### **Short-Term Study Evolution**

- Incorporation into Metis-Nation of Saskatchewan population-wide survey instruments
- SPOR-supported deployment of adapted & updated study with Long COVID registries across 4 western provinces
  - Administrative data linkage to smartphone-based reporting
  - Citizen science portals

## A Call to Action

- We are witness to imposition of a new high-burden chronic disease
- Like many others, the heaviest disease burden falls on vulnerable groups
- Post-covid condition patients experience high difficulty in seeking care
- This disease is preventable, has possible prophylaxis but high burden once emerged
- While exhibiting myriad manifestations, there is high structure that dynamic modeling can exploit
- Modeling of such conditions from the immunological through the population level is key to lower the burden and deliver effective care

# **Key References**

- Su, Y., Yuan, D., Chen, D.G., Ng, R.H., Wang, K., Choi, J., Li, S., Hong, S., Zhang, R., Xie, J. and Kornilov, S.A., 2022. Multiple early factors anticipate post-acute COVID-19 sequelae. Cell, 185(5), pp.881-895.
- Merad, M., Blish, C.A., Sallusto, F. and Iwasaki, A., 2022. The immunology and immunopathology of COVID-19. Science, 375(6585), pp.1122-1127.
- Mainous III, A.G., Rooks, B.J., Wu, V. and Orlando, F.A., 2021. COVID-19 Post-acute Sequelae Among Adults: 12 Month Mortality Risk. Frontiers in Medicine, p.2351. <u>https://www.frontiersin.org/articles/10.3389/fmed.2021.778434/full</u>
- Phetsouphanh, C., Darley, D.R., Wilson, D.B. et al. Immunological dysfunction persists for 8 months following initial mild-to-moderate SARS-CoV-2infection. Nat Immunol (2022). https://doi.org/10.1038/s41590-021-01113-x
- Xu, E., Xie, Y. & Al-Aly, Z. Long-term neurologic outcomes of COVID-19. Nat Med (2022). <u>https://doi.org/10.1038/s41591-022-02001-z</u>
- Roessler, M., Tesch, F., Batram, M., Jacob, J., Loser, F., Weidinger, O., Wende, D., Vivirito, A., Toepfner, N., Seifert, M. and Nagel, O., 2021. Post COVID-19 in children, adolescents, and adults: results of a matched cohort study including more than 150,000 individuals with COVID-19. MedRxiv. The article is accessible at the following address <u>https://www.medrxiv.org/content/10.1101/2021.10.21.21265133v1.full?s=08</u>
- Barrett ČE, Koyama AK, Alvarez P, et al. Risk for Newly Diagnosed Diabetes >30 Days After SARS-CoV-2 Infection Among Persons Aged <18 Years — United States, March 1, 2020–June 28, 2021. MMWR Morb Mortal Wkly Rep 2022;71:59–65. DOI: <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.15585/mmwr.mm7102e2external</u> icon
- Bowe, B., Xie, Y. & Al-Aly, Z. Acute and postacute sequelae associated with SARS-CoV-2 reinfection. Nat Med 28, 2398–2405 (2022). <u>https://doi.org/10.1038/s41591-022-02051-3</u> https://www.nature.com/articles/s41591-022-02051-3
- Brown et al. Long COVID and self-management. Lancet 2022. <u>https://www.thelancet.com/action/showPdf?pii=S0140-6736%2821%2902798-7</u>

# **Canadian Resources**

- Associations between Longer-term Symptoms after COVID-19 and Sociodemographics, Health Characteristics, Period of Infection, and Vaccination Status in Canadian Adults, January 2020 to August 2022 <u>https://health-infobase.canada.ca/src/doc/post-covid-condition/Association-Between-Longer-term-Symptoms-after-COVID-19.pdf</u>
- COVID-19: Longer-term symptoms among Canadian adults
  - Report: <u>https://health-infobase.canada.ca/src/doc/post-covid-condition/COVID-19-longer-term-symptoms-among-Canadian-adults.pdf</u>
  - Highlights: <u>https://health-infobase.canada.ca/covid-19/post-covid-condition/</u>
- Long-term symptoms in Canadian adults who tested positive for COVID-19 or suspected an infection, January 2020 to August 2022 <u>https://www150.statcan.gc.ca/n1/daily-quotidien/221017/dq221017b-eng.htm</u>
- Canadian COVID-19 Antibody and Health Survey (CCAHS) <u>https://www23.statcan.gc.ca/imdb/p2SV.pl?Function=getSurvey&SDDS=5339</u>

# **Other Notable Vaccination-Related Studies**

Al-Aly, Z., Bowe, B. and Xie, Y., 2022. Long COVID after breakthrough SARS-CoV-2 infection. Nature medicine, 28(7), pp.1461-1467.

Azzolini, E., Levi, R., Sarti, R., Pozzi, C., Mollura, M., Mantovani, A. and Rescigno, M., 2022. Association between BNT162b2 vaccination and long COVID after infections not requiring hospitalization in health care workers. Jama, 328(7), pp.676-678.

Daniel Ayoubkhani, Charlotte Bermingham, Koen B Pouwels, Myer Glickman, Vahé Nafilyan, Francesco Zaccardi, Kamlesh Khunti, Nisreen A Alwan, A Sarah Walker. Trajectory of long covid symptoms after covid-19 vaccination: community based cohort

Kuodi, P., Gorelik, Y., Zayyad, H., Wertheim, O., Wiegler, K.B., Jabal, K.A., Dror, A., Nazzal, S., Glikman, D. and Edelstein, M., 2022. Association between vaccination status and reported incidence of post-acute COVID-19 symptoms in Israel: a cross-sectional study of patients infected between March 2020 and November 2021. medRxiv.

Antonelli, M., Penfold, R.S., Merino, J., Sudre, C.H., Molteni, E., Berry, S., Canas, L.S., Graham, M.S., Klaser, K., Modat, M. and Murray, B., 2022. Risk factors and disease profile of post-vaccination SARS-CoV-2 infection in UK users of the COVID Symptom Study app: a prospective, community-based, nested, case-control study. The Lancet Infectious Diseases, 22(1), pp.43-55.

#### Vaccination post-infection

V.-T. Tran, E. Perrodeau, J. Saldanha, I. Pane, P. Ravaud, SSRN[Preprint] (2021); http://doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.3932953.
M. A. Simon, R. D. Luginbuhl, R. Parker, medRxiv2021.2011.2017.21263608 [Preprint] (2021); doi: 10.1101/2021.11.17.21263608.

## Acknowledgements

- Nastaran Jamali (featured Long COVID ABM)
- Wenjing Zhang & Amanda Zimmerman (machine learning modeling)
- Justin Pointer & Amanda Zimmerman (PCA analysis)
- Janelle Berscheid & Sophia Mills (Longitudinal progression in smartphone study)
- Marvi Baloch, Amanda Zimmerman, Jenna Mee: Smartphone-based study configuration & deployent
- Amanda Zimmerman: Smartphone study reporting
- CEPHIL Lab
- Mathematics for Public Health support
- NDO wants to extend special gratitude to SYK for inspiring this & related work